Take Nothing for Granted: Creative Strategies for Building More Equitable Pipelines for Underrepresented Students

Calvin Wise
Director of Recruitment
Johns Hopkins University

Ashley Pallie
Associate Dean of Admissions
Pomona College

Femi Ogundele
Assistant Dean of Diversity Outreach
Stanford University

#nacacGWI @NACACedu
Agenda

• Definitions of Access
• Research into Pipelines
• Johns Hopkins University
• Pomona College
• Stanford University
• Discussion
What do we mean when we say access?

Academic Preparation
Financial Support
Inclusion
Retention/Graduation

What does access mean to our institutions?
AP Testing by Race/Ethnicity

Percentage of Population

- Overall Graduating Class
- AP Exam Taker Population
- Population Scoring 3+ on an AP Exam

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/Ethnicity</th>
<th>Overall Graduating Class</th>
<th>AP Exam Taker Population</th>
<th>Population Scoring 3+ on an AP Exam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>American Indian/Alaska Native</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian/Asian American</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
<td>10.7%</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black/African American</td>
<td>14.5%</td>
<td>9.2%</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic/Latino</td>
<td>18.8%</td>
<td>18.8%</td>
<td>16.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>61.3%</td>
<td>55.9%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Percentile Testing by Race

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>Females</th>
<th>African American or Black</th>
<th>American Indian or Alaskan Native</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Critical Reading</td>
<td>Math</td>
<td>Writing</td>
<td>Critical Reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>750</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>98+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>700</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>550</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>450</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>350</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>300</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>250</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>794,802</td>
<td>794,802</td>
<td>794,802</td>
<td>903,719</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.D.</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>497</td>
<td>527</td>
<td>478</td>
<td>493</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## ACT Profile % All Applicants

### Table 1.8. Percent of Students in College Readiness Standards Score Ranges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CRS Range</th>
<th>English (Benchmark = 18)</th>
<th>Mathematics (Benchmark = 22)</th>
<th>Reading (Benchmark = 22)</th>
<th>Science (Benchmark = 23)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-12</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-15</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-19</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-23</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24-27</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28-32</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33-36</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% At or Above Benchmark</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACT % for Black Students

Table 1.6. Percent of Students in College Readiness Standards Score Ranges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CRS Range</th>
<th>English (Benchmark = 18)</th>
<th>Mathematics (Benchmark = 22)</th>
<th>Reading (Benchmark = 22)</th>
<th>Science (Benchmark = 23)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-12</td>
<td>100% 50% 0%</td>
<td>100% 50% 2%</td>
<td>100% 50% 18%</td>
<td>100% 50% 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-15</td>
<td>100% 50% 0%</td>
<td>100% 50% 24%</td>
<td>100% 50% 25%</td>
<td>100% 50% 22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-19</td>
<td>100% 50% 0%</td>
<td>100% 50% 44%</td>
<td>100% 50% 29%</td>
<td>100% 50% 34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-23</td>
<td>100% 50% 0%</td>
<td>100% 50% 18%</td>
<td>100% 50% 17%</td>
<td>100% 50% 21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24-27</td>
<td>100% 50% 0%</td>
<td>100% 50% 6%</td>
<td>100% 50% 6%</td>
<td>100% 50% 6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28-32</td>
<td>100% 50% 0%</td>
<td>100% 50% 2%</td>
<td>100% 50% 3%</td>
<td>100% 50% 1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33-36</td>
<td>100% 50% 0%</td>
<td>100% 50% 1%</td>
<td>100% 50% 1%</td>
<td>100% 50% 0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% At or Above Benchmark</td>
<td>100% 50% 0%</td>
<td>100% 50% 14%</td>
<td>100% 50% 16%</td>
<td>100% 50% 10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACT % for Latino Students
First-Generation Status by Race/Ethnicity

Percentage Distribution of U.S. 5- to 17-Year-Olds by First-Generation Status and Race/Ethnicity, 2011

Source: The Condition of Education 2012, NCES

---More than 1/3 of 5-17 year-olds in the U.S. are first-generation students
---This rate is highest among underrepresented minority groups

#nacacGWI @NACACedu
Gates Foundation: From Aspiration to Graduation: Dynamics Affecting College Success

• Study of 608,000 high income families (>$100,000; Mean $230,370) and 1,140,000 low income students (<$40,000; mean $17,330).
  • 59% of the high income students had parent’s with a Bachelor’s Degree or more.
  • 11% of the low income students had parent’s with a Bachelor’s Degree or more.
  • 95% of both groups aspired to attend college in middle school.
• 84% of the high income students enrolled in college.
• 82.4% of the high income students graduated from college.
• 41.4% of the low income students enrolled in college.
• 8.3% of the low income students graduated from college.
Gates Foundation: From Aspiration to Graduation: Dynamics Affecting College Success

**Dynamics inhibiting students**

- Difficulty meeting people from similar backgrounds
- Unable to navigate college bureaucracy
- Fail to seek support services
- Professors may be unsupportive
- Imposter syndrome
- Working to pay for tuition/living expenses vs professional experience (the achievement gap)
College Representation by Race in 1980 versus 2015

How much more or less each group is represented among freshmen at top colleges relative to the U.S. population

Affirmative Action Hasn’t Moved Needle Enough at Most Highly Selective Institutions


#nacacGWI @NACACedu
Socioeconomic Status and Freshmen Enrollment

Challenges Faced by HALI Students Applying to Selective Institutions

- Traveling for campus visits: 4.5
- Having non-competitive test scores: 4.4
- Understanding financial aid ("net" vs. "sticker" price): 4.2
- Believing that they deserve to apply (that they belong at these institutions): 4.2
- Understanding how to create a well-balanced college list: 3.9
- Writing essays (telling their story): 3.9
- Writing a resume: 3.5
- Completing the application: 3.3
- Navigating online application system(s): 3.2
- Getting recommenders to complete recommendations: 3.0

Average rating from 1 = “Not a challenge” to 5 = “Major challenge”

Source: Survey of 19 community-based organizations serving low-income students, conducted by the Cooke Foundation spring 2016. Survey question read: “To what extent do your students experience the following challenges when applying to selective colleges or universities?”

#nacacGW1 @NACACedu
Improving Admission of Low-SES Students at Selective Colleges: Results From an Experimental Simulation, Bastedo M. & Bowman N., 2017
K-12 Pipeline Challenges

• **1 in 5:** Almost 1 in 5 black high school students attend a high school that does not offer Advanced Placement (AP) courses.

• **1.5x:** Schools serving the most black and Latino students are 1.5 times more likely to employ teachers who are newest to the profession as compared to schools serving the fewest of those students.

• **<$1,913:** teachers in high schools serving the highest percentage of black and Latino students during the 2011-12 school year were paid on average $1,913 less per year than their colleagues in other schools within the same district that serve the lowest percentage of black and Latino students

October 2014 Dear Colleague Letter from the Assistant Secretary in the Department of Education’s Office for Civil Rights

#nacacGW1 @NACACedu
K-12 Pipeline Challenges

Differences in High Schools Math and Science Course Offerings

- **Offer Algebra II**
  - Serve Mostly Black/Latino: 74
  - Serve Fewest Black/Latino: 8

- **Offer Chemistry**
  - Serve Mostly Black/Latino: 68
  - Serve Fewest Black/Latino: 8

Source: October 2014 Dear Colleague Letter from the Assistant Secretary in the Department of Education’s Office for Civil Rights

#nacacGWI @NACACedu
K-12 Pipeline Challenges

Percentage of Student Enrollment vs. Enrolled in Calculus

Source: October 2014 Dear Colleague Letter from the Assistant Secretary in the Department of Education’s Office for Civil Rights

#nacacGWI @NACACedu
College Aspirations versus Enrollment by Race

Table 1. Percent of Students who Completed Steps to Four-Year College Enrollment, by Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Asian/Pacific Islander</th>
<th>Latino$^1$</th>
<th>African American$^2$</th>
<th>White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10th grade bachelor degree aspirations</td>
<td>95.6%</td>
<td>89.8%</td>
<td>92.8%</td>
<td>92.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolled in a four-year college</td>
<td>59.4</td>
<td>28.9</td>
<td>39.8</td>
<td>53.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% decline</td>
<td>-36.2</td>
<td>-60.9</td>
<td>-53</td>
<td>-39.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Adapted from Klasik, 2012)

The College Application Gauntlet: An Systematic Analysis of College Application Step Completion, Klasik, 2012
Assumptions About Students

- Fetishizing Struggle
- Asian Americans “versus” Black/Latinx Students
- Wanting Students to Prove How Underrepresented They Are
- Black Americans “versus” African Students
What Can You Do?

- Importance of Doing Your Institutional Homework
- If you don’t know what these mean for your own institution, you can’t begin
- WICHE Data
- How Does *Your* Institution Define:
  - Diversity
  - Access
  - Underrepresented
  - Students of Color
2017 Recruitment Review

• 1411 High School visits (61% at Public and Charter Schools)
• 109 Public Presentations
• 41 states, DC and PR
Insanity Is Doing the Same Thing Over and Over Again and Expecting Different Results
Workshops Team

School District Partnerships

• Anne Arundel County, Maryland
  – College search and application workshops done at all 3 Anne Arundel County IB schools.
  – During school hours, 3 sessions (2 morning and 1 afternoon)
  – Totaled approximately 225 students

• Osceola County, Florida
  – Select students at schools across the district participate in a college search and application workshop over the two days.
  – Two centralized locations in the district
  – Provided a letter of recommendation and essay workshop for teachers.
  – The evening program included sessions on the application, essays, financial aid, and JHU.
  – Totaled approximately 200 students.
Virtual Engagement Team

Info session (no/low recruitment areas)

Financial Aid 101

Admitted Student Sessions
Undermatching

Academic undermatching occurs when a student’s academic credentials permit them access to a college or university that is more selective than the postsecondary alternative they actually choose.

- Colleges: “[…] many colleges look for low-income students where the college is instead of looking for low-income students where the students are.”

- Students: “low-income students behavior is typical for their income […] attend (high) schools and live in neighborhoods that lack others who have attended or could attend selective colleges.”
# Student Centered Initiatives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early College Access Program (ECAP)</td>
<td>Alumni presentations designed for middle school and early high school students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pathways Brochure</td>
<td>Outreach brochure with college consideration road map and supplemental resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel Strategy</td>
<td>Targeted outreach at underserved &amp; rural high schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Based Orgs (CBO) Outreach</td>
<td>Purposeful visits to non-profits and orgs that cater specifically to low-income, first gen students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College Greenlight</td>
<td>Digital campaigns targeting low-income students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Going Home Project</td>
<td>Student ambassadors going back to their high school to tell their “My Stanford” story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quest Bridge</td>
<td>Source of some of the brightest low-income students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel Grants</td>
<td>Annually provides travel grants to admitted students to attend Admit Weekend (or other April weekend)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Gatekeeper Centered Initiatives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Counselor Fly-In Program</strong></td>
<td>Summer program for high school counselors and CBO staff in underserved communities to learn about Stanford admission, opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Stanford Counselor Outreach Program</strong></td>
<td>Regional counselor development workshops to gain nuanced understanding of college landscape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Counselor Workshops and Webinars</strong></td>
<td>Workshops provided to counselors to help them with advising around selective admissions and writing letters of recommendation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Counselor Newsletters</strong></td>
<td>Yearly and monthly newsletters sent to school counselors and CBOs with Stanford updates</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Stanford Counselor Outreach Program

Target Population

High Schools and Community Based Organizations that serve:
• > 33% FRPL
• < 50% 4 yr
• Majority “Minority” serving

University Partners

- Colgate University
- College of St. Scholastica
- Columbia University
- Dartmouth College
- Emory University
- Fond du Lac Tribal & Community College
- Gettysburg College
- John Hopkins
- MacCalister College
- Northland College
- Northwestern University
- Pamona Collage
- Princeton University
- Rutgers University
- Texas Christian University
- University of California Berkeley
- University of Chicago
- University of MN - Duluth
- University of Pennsylvania
- University of WI - Superior
- Virginia Tech

#nacacGWI @NACACedu
Pomona College

- Aligned diversity strategies across:
  - Strategic Plan for Diversity
  - Staff Responsibilities
  - Recruitment Access Goals
  - Case Study
  - Lessons Learned
10 Year Strategic Plan for Diversity

LIGHTING THE PATH TO 2025
A Vision for Diversity
Budget & Staff Resources

5 Officers on Diversity Team, plus an Admin. (6 of 21 staff in department)
Pomona’s Recruitment Access Goals

- Philosophy: If a diverse student body = diverse student pool, then students who are not naturally in our pool require our attention

- Majority of operating budget focused on diversity outreach

- Visit 50 States every 2 Years (will visit 49 this Fall)

- Visit all 34 California Geomarkets

- Visit at least 1 CBO in each territory

- Focus on public, charter, & rural schools – publics & charters = 62% of Fall HSV

- Talk about diversity & access as a pillar of College to every population
Case Study

• HALI Students
• Households of $65,000 or less for family of 4
• 39 Partner institutions meet 100% need
• Pomona partner institution since 2005
• QuestBridge College Match Scholar versus QuestBridge RD or ED Applicant
• Pomona typically Matches with 13-17 students a year
Pomona’s QB Stats

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Fall 2014</th>
<th>Fall 2015</th>
<th>Fall 2016</th>
<th>Fall 2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% Apps of Total</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>20.1</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Admits of Total</td>
<td>14.5</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>15.6</td>
<td>16.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of Class</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>14.2</td>
<td>15.6</td>
<td>15.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How We Did It

• Targeted Communications
  – Monthly meetings with Communications Office to discuss College-wide communications
  – College stories highlighted undocumented/DACAmented, first-generation, community college transfers, rural, underrepresented, etc.

• Removed all cost barriers
  – Free application
  – Free test score submission

• Trained staff to read applications with student context in mind

• All admits invited to spring fly-in
• Full campus buy in
Lessons Learned:
Our Behind the Scenes Conversations

• What level of institutional support is necessary to sustain the diversity we are attempting to achieve?
• Importance of measuring the right types of success for your institution
  – Director of Institutional Research creates annual Diversity Indicators
  – High Impact Practices (community service, research with faculty, study abroad, etc.)
• When you have diversity, you become so aware of inclusion, especially the lack thereof. Diversity is simply the first step.
• “How do we know we’ve hit critical mass? That students have found their voice and they are unafraid to use it.” ~ Associate Dean Nicole Weekes
• “Human diversity is not a problem we need to solve.” – President Starr
Discussion
Thank You

Ashley Pallie
Pomona College
Ashley.Pallie@pomona.edu

Olufemi Ogundele
Assistant Dean of Diversity Outreach
olufemi@Stanford.edu

Calvin Wise
Johns Hopkins University
Calvin.wise@jhu.edu